



**MINUTES OF JUNE 16, 2020
REGULAR MEETING OF THE SAN GABRIEL CITY COUNCIL**

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Menchaca called the regular meeting of the San Gabriel City Council to order at 6:31 p.m. on Tuesday, June 16, 2020, with all Council Members and staff participating by teleconference.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Council Member Ding.

ROLL CALL

Council Members Present: Tony Ding, John R. Harrington, Jason Pu, Vice Mayor Chin Ho Liao, and Mayor Denise Menchaca.

Council Members Absent: None.

Staff Members Present: City Manager Mark Lazzaretto, City Attorney Keith Lemieux, Assistant City Manager/Community Development Director Arminé Chaparyan, Community Services/Interim Mission Playhouse Director Rebecca Perez, Police Chief Eugene Harris, Chief City Clerk Sharon Clark, Public Works Director/City Engineer Greg de Vinck, Fire Chief Steven Wallace, Human Resources/Risk Management Director Edward Macias, Interim Finance Director Kenneth Louie, and Assistant City Clerk Marilyn Bonus.

Mayor Menchaca provided information for the public on how to view the meeting and submit comments.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA ORDER

Council Member Pu requested that New Business items 6A and 6B be considered in reversed order as item 6B could have an effect on budget item 6A.

A motion was made by Vice Mayor Liao, seconded by Council Member Pu, to accept the agenda order as amended to consider item 6A after agenda item 6B.

Motion carried by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: DING, HARRINGTON, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

2. PRESENTATIONS

A. INTRODUCTION OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT MANAGER DOMENICA MEGERDICHIAN

Presentation was made by Assistant City Manager/Community Development Director Arminé Chaparyan.

B. COVID-19 BRIEFING

Mayor Menchaca announced that this will be an ongoing presentation on the Agenda until the COVID-19 epidemic ends to keep the public informed directly from the City's first responders and staff.

Presentations were made by Fire Chief Wallace, Police Chief Harris, and City Manager Lazzaretto.

Discussion ensued on a subcommittee of Council Members to assist with outreach to the business community regarding COVID-19-related assistance, with Vice Mayor Liao and Council Member Ding agreeing to serve on the committee. The matter will be agendized for the next regular City Council meeting.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

Debbie Kilgore provided questions regarding police staffing levels proportionate to the population and possible results of decreasing police officer positions.

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

In response to questions from Vice Mayor Liao regarding Item 4C, City Manager Lazzaretto explained that funds from Certificates of Deposit (CDs) which mature are reinvested by placing them into the Local Agency Investment Fund, and that the Finance Director makes those decisions on a daily basis in accordance with the City's Investment Policy.

A motion was made by Vice Mayor Liao, seconded by Mayor Menchaca, to approve Consent Calendar Items 4A – 4G as presented.

Motion approved Consent Calendar Items 4A – 4G as presented by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES:	DING, HARRINGTON, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES:	NONE
ABSTAIN:	NONE
ABSENT:	NONE

A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The City Council approved the following items as presented:

1. Minutes of the City Council Special Meeting of May 27, 2020.
2. Minutes of the City Council Special Meeting of June 2, 2020.
3. Minutes of the City Council Regular Meeting of June 2, 2020.

B. MATERIAL DEMANDS

The City Council approved the May 22, 2020, and May 27, 2020 Registers of Demands and Warrants for the payment of City expenditures.

C. CASH AND INVESTMENT REPORT – MAY 2020

The City Council received and filed the Cash and Investment Report for May 2020.

D. STATEMENT OF INVESTMENT POLICY 2020-2021

The City Council adopted **Resolution No. 20-30** adopting the 2020-2021 Statement of Investment Policy.

E. ACCEPTANCE OF FINAL TRACT MAP NO. 72990 (608 SOUTH RAMONA STREET) PLANNING CASE NO. TMAP18-002

The City Council accepted Final Tract Map No. 72990 and authorized filing with the Los Angeles County Recorder.

F. APPOINTMENTS TO THE CITY'S COMMISSIONS

The City Council approved the following appointments recommended by the Mayor for full terms of two years, expiring on 5/30/2022:

- Community Services Commission: Cheryl Anne Cabot and Theresa Huerta;
- Design Review Commission: Raymond Cheng, Marla Nadolney, and Nik Sae-Low;
- Historic Preservation and Cultural Resource Commission: Beatrix Mojarro and Kyle DeVriendt; and
- Planning Commission: Mark Juarez, Thomas Klawiter, and Jingbo Lou.

The City Council approved the following appointment recommended by the Mayor for an unexpired term expiring on 5/30/2021:

- Community Services Commission: Wei (Nancy) Fang.

G. SECOND READING AND ADOPTION OF ORDINANCE NO. 664 ESTABLISHING NON-EXCLUSIVE TOWING SERVICE FRANCHISES

The City Council:

1. Adopted **Ordinance No. 664** to establish non-exclusive towing services franchises; and
2. Authorized the City to enter into tow service agreements with qualified tow service operators.

5. PUBLIC HEARING – None.

6. NEW BUSINESS

B. ANIMAL CARE AND CONTROL SERVICES AGREEMENT

Presentation was made by Assistant City Manager/Community Development Director Arminé Chaparyan. San Gabriel Humane Society (SGHS) Board President Cindy Rigny was also present virtually to answer questions.

No public comment was received.

Discussion included value received versus cost; reasons for cost increases including minimum wage hikes and an increase in the number of animals; full service versus a la carte services; hybrid service models; the SGHS adding additional cities to share overhead expenses; effects of the COVID-19 crisis; convenience of SGHS being located in the City; SGHS staff pay is less costly than City employee pay; the City receives licensing revenue; possibility of licensing cats; partnering for fund-raising and provision of other services; the possibility of City representation on the SGHS Board; exploring alternative service models over the next year; going without some services or having a shorter agreement with SGHS; and numbers and types of calls for service.

A motion was made by Vice Mayor Liao, seconded by Mayor Menchaca, to approve a six-month agreement with San Gabriel Humane Society for \$175,000, with an option to extend the agreement for six months at \$175,000.

Motion carried by a vote of 4-1 as follows:

AYES:	DING, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES:	HARRINGTON
ABSTAIN:	NONE
ABSENT:	NONE

RECESS AND RECONVENE

Mayor Menchaca recessed the meeting at 9:02 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 9:12 p.m. with all Council Members present.

A. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS APPROVING THE OPERATING BUDGET AND CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM AND ESTABLISHING THE APPROPRIATIONS LIMIT FOR FISCAL YEAR 2020-21

Presentation was made by Interim Finance Director Ken Louie.

Mayor Menchaca added that although we will have a placeholder for a Budget update for the second City Council meeting of each month, if revenues drop or expenses increase, an update will be provided sooner.

The following provided comments in opposition to defunding/reducing the Police Department Budget: Lei Wang, San Gabriel business owner; Christine Tureaud; Galvin S. Templar, resident; Lynn Snowden, resident; Linda Parmenter; Carla J. Seifi; Jing Wu, resident; Rodney Luck, resident; Fion Chan, resident; D. Barrera, resident; Brenda, resident; Sue Fitzsimmons; Tracy Ellis, resident; Mirta Isla, resident; Harold Jeffs, resident; Marilyn Jeffs, resident; Melanie Lehocz, resident; James L. Perea, resident; Linda D. Perea, resident; Alexis Salamanca, President, San Gabriel Chamber of Commerce and San Gabriel business owner; Gloria Sorenson, resident; Larry Sorenson, resident; Sophia Tsoi, resident; Alice Wong, resident; Thomas Wong, resident; Robert A. Carreon; Melanie L., resident; Gina; Patty Rodriguez, resident; Lisa H., resident; Mark Zacher; Brad Cadle; and Anna.

The following provided comments in favor of reducing the Police Department Budget in favor of various other options: Gabriel Frank-McPheter; Joshua Raymundo; Chasity Jennings-Nunez and 47 additional individuals.

Comments not stating a position on this item were also provided by: Charmaine Liccardi, resident; Julie Casciani; and Sean McMorris, resident.

Discussion included the need to listen to all stakeholders; positive reforms Police Chief Harris has already implemented to the betterment of the community;

examining all City government culture, not just in the Police Department; having a placeholder for animal control services as the outcome of that agreement is not yet known; ad hominem attacks made during public comment and clarification of Council Member comments made at the previous City Council meeting; diversion or defunding of the Police Department Budget equates to less officers in the field; having a back-up plan if the San Gabriel Valley Humane Society (SGVHS) doesn't approve a six-month agreement; adding a social services program without taking money from the Police Department budget; keeping bi-lingual pay for police officers; budgeting for lawsuit costs; vehicle maintenance costs; ability to make budget adjustments in the future; appreciation for the recent civic engagement by young-adult residents; commendation for improvements Police Chief Harris and the Police Department have made; and having facts before making changes to the budget.

A motion was made by Mayor Menchaca, seconded by Vice Mayor Liao, to adopt the following:

1. **Resolution No. 20-29** Adopting the City's Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2020-21; and
2. **Resolution No. 20-24** Approving the 2020-21 to 2024-25 Five-Year Capital Improvement Program and Adopting a Capital Improvement Program Budget for Fiscal Year 2020-21; and
3. **Resolution No. 20-27** Establishing the Gann Appropriations Limit for Fiscal Year 2020-21.

Motion approved New Business Item 6A as presented by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: DING, HARRINGTON, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

Concern was voiced regarding the late addition of items to the agenda in regard to allowing time for proper review.

A motion was made by Council Member Pu, seconded by Vice Mayor Liao to continue consideration of agenda item 6C past 11:00 p.m.

Motion carried by a vote of 4-1 as follows:

AYES: DING, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES: HARRINGTON
ABSTAIN: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

C. REQUEST TO APPOINT TWO CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS TO A SUB-COMMITTEE TO SERVE AS A LIAISON BETWEEN THE CITY COUNCIL AND THE COMMUNITY FOR THE COMMUNITY DISCUSSION DESCRIBED IN RESOLUTION NO. 20-31

Presentation was made by Mayor Menchaca.

The following provided comments requesting the appointment of Mayor Menchaca and Council Member Pu to the sub-committee and requesting that Council Member Harrington not be appointed to the sub-committee: Gabriel Frank-McPheter; and George Valdez.

The following provided comments in support of the formation of a sub-committee: Monica Bouffard, resident; Catherine Cordero, resident; Devyn Cordero, resident; Chris Cordero, resident; Joel Cordero, resident; and Chasity Jennings-Nuñez.

The following provided comments in support of the formation of a subcommittee and requesting that Council Member Harrington not be appointed to the sub-committee: Alejandra Benavides, resident; and Sean McMorris, resident.

Cheryl Cabot provided comments requesting the appointment of Mayor Menchaca and Council Member Pu to the subcommittee.

Long Z. Liu, San Gabriel business member, provided comments requesting that the sub-committee's vision be toward bolstering the Police Department.

Scott Dutra, resident, provided comments requesting that the sub-committee be used to create more community programs and to support the Police Department with resources.

Abraham Odabachian provided comments in support of the Police Department.

A San Gabriel resident provided comments requesting that the City Council not support any of the seven demands of Chasity Jennings-Nunez.

Comments stating we need to listen to our youth were provided by an anonymous commenter.

A motion was made by Mayor Menchaca to appoint herself and Council Member Pu to the sub-committee.

Discussion included concern about the late timing of the placement of this item on the agenda; the desire for all members of the City Council to directly engage with the community; preference for the Executive Team, City Manager, and Police and Fire Chiefs to lead the sub-committee with Chief Harris as the lead, or alternatively, to have two rotating Council Members on the sub-committee with all having equal right to participate and none appearing consecutively; all stakeholders need to be invited and it should stay San Gabriel focused; and having well-announced meetings that are audio-recorded.

Council Member Harrington requested to amend the motion to include setting up a community whistle-blower hotline which would be anonymous and have a phone line and email monitored by the City Manager, Assistant City Manager and both Chiefs, for reporting perceived racism and perceived unequal treatment, with oversight from the City Attorney.

Discussion continued on the sub-committee as a standing committee subject to the Brown Act versus an ad hoc committee and associated provisions for each type of meeting; and setting up a standing commission on the same topic.

Vice Mayor Liao seconded the Mayor's motion.

Discussion continued on the receipt of comments on both sides of the issue, and the length of time and how often the sub-committee would meet.

City Attorney Lemieux suggested that an ad hoc committee be established to determine the goals, composition, length of time and other details for the

formation of a committee for the community conversations, at which point we can better understand how the Brown Act would apply.

Discussion continued on the sub-committee as an ad hoc committee to engage stakeholders and gather initial information to define a framework of desired goals, outcomes and process for the project, pursuant to Resolution 20-31.

Mayor Menchaca amended her motion, to appoint herself and Council Member Pu to an ad hoc sub-committee to gather the initial information and define a framework as prescribed by the resolution we passed, Resolution No. 20-31. Vice Mayor Liao seconded the amended motion.

Discussion continued regarding the formation of a standing commission; the time frame for the sub-committee to report back to the full Council; the timeline for the sub-committee to complete its task; and clarification on the purpose and methodology for the sub-committee.

Mayor Menchaca withdrew her motion with Vice Mayor Liao's consent. She made a new motion, seconded by Vice Mayor Liao, to appoint Council Member Pu and herself for an ad hoc sub-committee with a timeline of two months, with the purpose of gathering information and defining the framework for us to move forward with the conversations that we committed to with Resolution No. 20-31.

Motion carried by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: DING, HARRINGTON, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

A motion was made by Vice Mayor Liao, seconded by Mayor Menchaca, to continue considering agenda items after 11:00 p.m.

Motion carried by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: DING, HARRINGTON, PU, LIAO, MENCHACA
NOES: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

7. PUBLIC COMMENT – None.

8. CITY MANAGER'S REPORT – None.

9. COUNCIL COMMENTS AND CONFERENCE/MEETING REPORTS

Council Member Ding thanked all the residents for their comments, thanked staff for staying with the Council in this meeting past 12:00 a.m., and commented that for the future, with our teamwork, residents will like to live in our City.

Council Member Harrington requested a progress update from City Manager Lazzaretto on changing the ordinance regarding variances. City Manager Lazzaretto responded that he would send an update to the Council by email and put it on the Council agenda for July 7, 2020. Council Member Harrington thanked everyone for staying in for the whole meeting.

Vice Mayor Liao reported on a phone conference with Congresswoman Maxine Waters, Savannah, Georgia Mayor Van Johnson, and the Black Caucus regarding the Heroes Act; and reported that the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) has requested a letter of support from the City for delaying the implementation of Senate Bill 743 regarding Vehicle Miles Traveled.

Mayor Menchaca thanked her colleagues for passing the Budget on time and noted the Council will continue to have meetings on the Budget; commented that it is her and Council Member Ding's first meeting past midnight; and thanked staff for still being present.

10. CLOSED SESSION – None.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Mayor Menchaca adjourned the meeting at 12:17 a.m. on June 17, 2020.

Respectfully submitted:


SHARON F. CLARK, Chief City Clerk

Approved this 21st day of July, 2020:


DENISE MENCHACA, Mayor